

Letting the wolf in: the duality of human and animal, inclusion and exclusion and the crossing of these boundaries of the werewolves in Gerald of Wales'

Topographia Hibernica

Deixando o lobo entrar: a dualidade de humano e animal, inclusão e exclusão e o cruzamento dessas fronteiras pelos lobisomens na Topographia Hibernica de Giraldus Cambrensis

Dejar entrar al lobo: la dualidad de lo humano y lo animal, la inclusión y la exclusión y el cruce de estos límites por los hombres-lobo en la *Topographia Hibernica* de Giraldus Cambrensis

Julia van ROSMALEN¹

Abstract: This article shows, using a close analysis of the images and text, that despite the initial association with 'Othering' and monstrousness, the werewolves from the *Topographia Hibernica* are not a perfect Other but rather assimilated into the community. They represent a transgression between the boundaries of the human and the animal that renders them porous and allows for movement between the two and an interplay of inclusion and exclusion. The werewolves aren't hybrids in form or nature, but rather show a discordance between form and nature: They are perfectly animal in appearance and perfectly human in nature. The deliberate parallel with theory of form and nature in the eucharist which plays a central role in both the conclusion of the story, the final image and the authors theological discourse on transformation shows that the final verdict on the wolves is one of sameness rather than otherness.

Resumo: Este artigo pretende apresentar, a partir de uma análise atenta das imagens e do texto, que apesar da associação inicial com o 'Outro' e a monstruosidade, os lobisomens da *Topographia Hibernica* não são um Outro perfeito, mas sim assimilados pela comunidade. Eles representam uma transgressão entre os limites do humano e do animal que os torna porosos e permite o movimento entre os dois e uma interação entre inclusão e exclusão. Os lobisomens não são híbridos na forma ou na natureza, mas mostram uma discordância entre a forma e a natureza: eles são perfeitamente animais na aparência e perfeitamente humanos na natureza. O paralelo deliberado com a teoria da forma e da natureza na eucaristia, que desempenha um papel central tanto na conclusão da história, na imagem final e no discurso teológico do autor sobre a transformação, mostra que o veredito final sobre os lobos é de semelhança e não de alteridade.

¹ Voluntary research fellow at KU Leuven. *E-mail*: <u>julia.merit.van.rosmalen@gmail.com</u>.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

Keywords: Depiction of the other – Monsters and hybrids – Boundaries – Eucharist theory – Form and nature – Transformation – Liminality – Inclusion and exclusion – Duality.

Palavras-chave: Representação do outro – Monstros e híbridos – Limites – Teoria da Eucaristia – Forma e natureza – Transformação – Liminalidade – Inclusão e exclusão – Dualidade.

ENVIADO: 30.06.2020 ACEPTADO: 20.11.2020

Introduction

Gerald of Wales (1146-1223) was a churchman and a scholar employed by the English court. In 1185 he accompanied Prince John (1166-1216) on a journey to Ireland. In the following year he compiled his findings in what would come to be the *Topographia Hibernica*.² In this text that mostly deals with the nature and customs of Ireland, Gerald of Wales also included a section titled de *mirabilius nostri temporis*, strange tales that were supposed to have happened in his own lifetime. Amongst these is the tale that became known as *the werewolves of Ossory*, titled by Gerald *De lupo cum sacerdote loquentur*.³

In this tale a priest and his companion travel through the woods on their way to Meath. When making camp for the night they are approached by a wolf. The wolf speaks to them in a human voice and they are alarmed. The wolf reassures them that he means no harm and asks for their help. He explains that he suffers the curse of the saint Natalis: The people of Ossory, to which he belongs, received a punishment where a man and a woman were chosen to spend seven years in the woods as wolves. Should they survive this seven-year period, they were allowed to return to Ossory and two others were to be sent in their stead. In this case though, his wife will not survive the seven-year period as

² MCKENDRICK, Scot; LOWDEN, John; DOYLE, Kathleen. Royal Manuscripts: the Genius of Illumination. London: British Library, 2011, p. 287.

³ This summary is based on my own translation of the Latin transcribed by James F. Dimock. The work by Dimock is known as the 'Rolls Series' it is a multi-volume set of transcriptions of all the works of Gerald of Wales, the works are prefaced by comparative studies of manuscripts known to Dimock. *Geraldus Cambriensis Opera* will hereafter be shortened to *GCO* followed by the volume and what work of Gerald is being cited. GIRALDUS CAMBRIENSIS. *Geraldus Cambriensis Opera* (ed. James F. Dimock). London, 1867, 8 v. For the story of the werewolves of Ossory see *GCO*, *Topographia Hibernica*, v. 5, p. 101-107.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

she lies dying. The wolf implores the priest to give her the last sacrament. The priest follows the wolf to its den and finds that there indeed the female wolf lies on her deathbed. The priest has second thoughts about committing the blasphemy of administering the last rites to an animal. To prove that she is truly a lady, the male wolf peels back her wolf-skin and reveals a sick old lady. The priest gives the sacraments "duly rather than rightly", 4 without much conviction.

While this tale already speaks to the imagination on its own, it is accompanied in three of the manuscripts in which it features by a series of illustrations in the margin. These three manuscripts are 'London', BL Royal MS. 13. B viii; 'Dublin', National Library of Ireland, MS 700; and 'Cambridge', University Library MS, Ff.i.27. These manuscripts will hereafter be referred to by the cities where they are currently kept.⁵ Providing us with three medieval images of a werewolf. While the twelfth century saw an increase in texts interested in lycanthropy, none of these texts were illustrated. The werewolves of Ossory are unique, as werewolves seem otherwise absent from the history of the medieval illustrated manuscript.6

Because of this the illustrations in the *Topographia Hibernica* offer un an unique insight in how a werewolf transformation might be imagined in the Middle Ages.⁷ In previous scholarship it has been shown that there is a medieval tradition of representing the difference between the 'Self' and the 'Other' visually through ascribing monstrous or animalistic features to the 'Other'. In light of this scholarship it is proposed by Rhonda Knight that the tale of the werewolves as well as the rest of the *Topographia* can be read

 4 "Ergo rite potius quam recte peractis". — GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 103.

⁵ For recent scholarship on text editions see: ROONEY, Catherine. The manuscripts of the works of Gerald of Wales. PhD dissertation, University of Cambridge, 2005; SARGENT, Amelia Borego. "Gerald of Wales's Topographia Hibernica: Dates, Versions, Readers". In: Viator, v. 43, n. 1, 2012, p. 241-261; SARGENT, Amelia Borego. Visions and Revisions: Gerald of Wales, Authorship, and the Construction of Political, Religious, and Legal Geographies in Twelfth and Thirteenth Century Britain. PhD dissertation, University of Berkeley, 2011.

⁶ John Block Friedman describes this lack of images when he looks for possible sources for later prints of werewolves. FRIEDMAN, John B. "Werewolf transformation in the Manuscript Era". In: Journal of the Early Book Society, v. 17, 2015, p. 36-95.

A thorough study on the twelfth century attitudes towards depicting transformation, or the lack thereof, and the way transformation is handled by Gerald of Wales has been done by Caroline Walker Bynum. BYNUM, Caroline Walker. "Metamorphosis, or Gerald and the Werewolf". In: Speculum, v. 73, n. 4, 1998, p. 987-1013.

⁸ See MELLINKOFF, Ruth. Outcasts: Signs of Otherness in Northern European Art of the Late Middle Ages. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

as Marcher propaganda that aims to portray the Irish as bestial and uncivilised in order to excuse their incursions into Ireland.⁹

This article will show, using a close analysis of the images and text, that despite the initial association with 'Othering' and monstrousness, the werewolves from the *Topographia Hibernica* are not a perfect Other but rather assimilated into the community. They represent a transgression between the boundaries of the human and the animal that renders them porous and allows for movement between the two and an interplay of inclusion and exclusion.

In the next section the relationship between text and image will be closely examined. It will be investigated what scenes are illustrated and what choices are made in how the figures are depicted.

I. BL Royal MS. 13. B viii

In the 'London' manuscript the text is accompanied by three marginal illustrations and additional glosses. The story commences on f.17v. Here we find two episodes from the story (**image 1**). In the first scene we see a man seated near a fire while being approached by a wolf. The miniature is situated below a column of text, which does not contain the story about the wolf. The story of the werewolves of Ossory begins in the second column near the bottom after the heading in red ink. The text mentions that the priest is "accompanied by one young boy" who is not represented here. This is where a large part of the conversation between the wolf and the priest takes place. In the image the priest has his mouth opened which might indicate speech and gestures with his hands. It is also possible that the raised hands and slightly grimacing face are there to signify the fear of the priest upon seeing the wolf. He is described as "stupefied" and "Trembling" all throughout the story.

The next miniature shows the priest following the wolf to its den. The direction in which wolf and the priest move follows the reading direction through a narrative movement from left to right. The wolf looks over its shoulder back at the priest to make sure that he is being followed. The following episode is situated on the next

⁹ KNIGHT, Rhonda. "Werewolves, monsters, and miracles: representing colonial fantasies in gerald of wales's *Topographia hibernica*". *In: Studies in Iconography*, v. 22, 2001, p. 55-86.

¹⁰ "Uno tantum comitatus puerulo." – GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 101.

^{11 &}quot;Obstupuissent" – GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 101.

¹² "Tremebundus" – GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 102.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

page on f. 18r. (**image 2**). Here we see the priest administering the host to the dying female wolf. The wolf, placed next to him, is wearing an object around its neck. In the story this passage is ambiguous:

Which [hosts] the priest swore firmly he didn't have, the wolf who had withdrawn a short time returned again, showing to the priest a little purse, containing a psalter and some consecrated hosts; that according to the habit of the country a priest on his journey carried around his neck.¹³

The most straightforward reading of this sentence would suggest that the priest was the one wearing the 'perulam', a type of purse, around his neck. "Carried around his neck" however, is written in third person masculine singular and thus could apply either to the priest or the wolf. The image depicts the wolf as the one that has the purse suspended from its neck. This purse contained the host and missal that are used to administer the last rites to the dying female wolf.



Detail: Topographia Hibernica, The wolf conversing with the priest and the priest following the wolf (c.1196-1223). Ink drawings on parchment, 275 x 190 mm, London, British Library Royal MS. 13. B viii f.17v.

The female wolf is placed in an 'enclosure' which is meant to represent her den as evident by the vegetation growing upon it. The den forms a pictorial boundary,

¹³ "Quo [hostias] sacerdos cum se career firmiter asseruisset, lupus qui parumper abscesserat iterum accesit, ostendens ei perulam, librum manualem et aliquot hostias consecrates continentem; quae more patriae presbyter itinerans a collo suspensa deferebat." – *GCO*, *Topographia Hibernica*, v. 5, p. 102.

¹⁴ "A colo suspenda deferebat" – GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 102.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

separating the female wolf from the other figures in the image. The priest is offering the she-wolf the host and the extended host crosses the boundary of the den, like a bridge between her and the priest.



Detail: Topographia Hibernica, The She-wolf receives the Viaticum (c.1196-1223). Ink drawings on parchment, 275 x 190 mm, London: British Library Royal MS. 13. B viii f.18r

II. National Library of Ireland, ms. 700

In the 'Dublin' manuscript the story is more sparsely decorated than the 'London' one: The three-image cycle is reduced to one image (**image 3**). Unlike in the previous two manuscripts the priest's assistant boy is depicted and is now standing near the fire while the priest converses with the wolf

It is interesting that the scene where the priest converses with the wolf has been chosen as the pivotal moment in the story to be illustrated and not the administering of the host to the dying she-wolf. The biggest stylistic difference can be found in the depiction of the wolf who is now distinctly bears less resemblance to a real wolf than the depiction in the 'London' and the 'Cambridge' manuscript. In this manuscript the emphasis is strongly on speech.

The fact that the werewolves are capable of human speech is reiterated again and again in the story: "what manner of creature he was, that he under his bestial form brought forth human words" In the image the priest now distinctly raises his hand

¹⁵ "Et quaenam creatura fuiset, quae sub bestiali forma humana verba proferret" – GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 101.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

with a raised index finger in a gesture that in medieval manuscripts often indicates speech.¹⁶ This gesture was more ambiguous in the other manuscripts. Not only does the priest make the speaking gesture, there is extra emphasis on the wolf's capacity for speech as he raises his paw, mirroring the gesture made by the priest. In this way it is indicated that the two are engaged in a conversation that goes both ways.



Topographia Hibernica, Lupus and Vulpis (c. 1220), parchment and ink, 278 x 182 mm, f. 23r, Dublin National Library of Ireland, MS 700.

III. Cambridge University Library ms, Ff.i.27

This manuscript very closely follows the composition and iconography from the 'London' manuscript and is believed to be a direct copy of it. One of the biggest differences is the placement of the miniatures. In the 'London' manuscript the miniatures were all situated on the same bifolium.

This resulted in a strong narrative flow from left to right, where the picture of the priest following the wolf functioned as an extra incentive to create that movement. In the 'Cambridge' manuscript however, each miniature is placed on a separate folio (images 4 and 5).

¹⁶ SCHMITT, Jean-Claude. La raison des gestes dans l'Occident medievale. Paris: Gallimard, 1990, p. 171.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

Image 4



Detail: *Topographia Hibernica*, *The priest speaking with the wolf* (third quarter thirteenth century), 305 x 229 mm, tempera on parchment, Cambridge, Cambridge University Library MS Ff.1.27, p. 316.

e tisus mediam unicianie. isil that grant maternation in aquadam visita medie per nochaste. Cumqi ad ignicului quem s' dub arboze quadă sto tuitu duine pietatus m tosa coesterar. Uno uni comma dulgeas. De do: lupă pie

Detail: GIRALDUS CAMBRIENSIS, *Topographia Hibernica, The priest follows the wolf* (third quarter thirteenth century), 305 x 229 mm, tempera on parchment, Cambridge, Cambridge University Library MS Ff.1.27, p. 317.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818



Detail: GIRALDUS CAMBRIENSIS, *Topographia Hibernica, The she-wolf receives the viaticum* (third quarter thirteenth century), 305 x 229 mm, tempera on parchment, Cambridge, Cambridge University Library MS Ff.1.27, p. 318.

IV. Natural depictions of wolves in the *Topographia Hibernica*

It is noteworthy that the story of the werewolves of Ossory is not the sole place in the *Topographia Hibernica* where wolves occur. Gerald shows a strong interest in the natural world and extensively describes Ireland's climate and flora and fauna. He bases his descriptions on second-hand accounts but also for a large part on personal observation.¹⁷

A wolf and fox illustrate the passage "On weasels, and their nature". The animals are mentioned only briefly near the end of this section. He quotes Bede on the presence of the animals on the island: "Bede described the island as having only two kinds of noxious animals: that is to say wolves and foxes." he then states that the weasel can

¹⁷ Urban T. Holmes argues that by doing this he is part of a movement of thirteenth-century naturalism. He points out that authors like Vincent of Beauvais in *Speculum Naturam*, Bartholomew the Englishman in *De proprietatibus rerum* and Albertus Magnus *De Animalibus* started supplementing their antique sources with personal observation. HOLMES, Urban T. "Gerald the Naturalist". *In: Speculum*, v. 11, n. 1, 1936, p. 111.

¹⁸ "Duo tantum animalium genera nociva insulam habere Beda describit; lupos silicet et vulpus". – *GCO*, *Topographia Hibernica*, v. 5, p. 61.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

be added to this category as a third. It is noteworthy that the wolf receives the adjective 'nociva' which can mean hurtful, injurious or noxious. In this context it probably signifies that the wolf is a potentially dangerous or harmful animal. In all the three discussed manuscripts this passage is illustrated with marginal depictions of the animals discussed.

When we compare the depiction of the werewolf with the depiction of the regular wolf in the three manuscripts they are near identical in all three cases. The wolf in the London' manuscript (**image 7**) shares with the werewolf its silver coat and the proportions of the animal are the same. The wolf in the 'Dublin' manuscript (**image 8**) differs stylistically from the wolves in the other two manuscripts in the exact same way that the werewolf in the 'Dublin' manuscript differs from the werewolves in the other two manuscripts. The wolf in the 'Dublin' manuscript is identical to the werewolf in the same manuscript.

The fact that the werewolf looks the exact same as the normal animal is important. It shows that there is nothing about them that indicates outward monstrousness. Rather, we are speaking of a shapeshifter, a human in animal guise. This shall later be contrasted with the depiction of the werewolf in the early modern period. If there is anything to indicate that we are here faced with a werewolf and not a regular wolf the only sign in the images is the behaviour of the wolf when carrying the missal (in the 'Dublin' manuscript there is nothing that really differentiates the werewolf from a regular wolf safe for the gesture of speech).



Detail: Topographia Hibernica, Lupus et Vulpis London (c.1196-1223). Ink drawings on parchment, 275 x 190 mm, London: British Library Royal MS. 13. B viii f.11r



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

Image 8 I mula, minica ii miretti mii. qui Mumunt-1 welles seraras Felan as man was arreative and and रतावृत्य क्रियालीम क्रिय ervicudi gin lervencel in ollul enel fat demolicated torrodunit. Du Man funt-S; amaro medium ma o un afalum gra nouna ifula apolhrophando ed hibina aufum infineatedr. bio Beda describir lupos (7 uni nammel a mosturepulie or pet Aos frum hoc accumulty rum de firmite allacum medut nocentifimum bevenut; cof Thuchbemmara mahna bengm quefectibi Fuenenofit omm or aura puant. Cumaroref to bus the deficientib ves. occeam incarorel afferencel auch Acer omia simum gria lot no umi. qo cum nauet i www bilor nomithibina gancet veneno fiche onfib; caret. Caret ferpenti mo anquotient exhonerations? butonet calu illatos infundo na by 7 colubs. Carer bufonth; 7 ka

Topographia Hibernica, Lupus and Vulpis (c. 1220), parchment and ink, 278 x 182 mm, f. 14v, Dublin National Library of Ireland, MS 700.

Comparing the text and the images has firstly revealed the emphasis on the werewolf's capacity of speech. Secondly the appearance of the werewolf is not discernible from that of an 'ordinary' wolf. The non-animal nature of the werewolf becomes apparent in the images when it displays human behaviour such as carrying the pouch which contained the missal and the hosts.

The human nature of the wolf enables the priest to develop an emotional relationship with it which is expressed in their interactions. Which culminates when the priest breaches a pictorial boundary between himself and the female wolf through the administering of the host. This draws attention to the fact that in none of these manuscripts the transformation of the she-wolf into a human is depicted despite the text describing how the wolf half peeled back her skin to reveal the old lady when she received the host.

V. The Irish as werewolves

It has been mentioned before that Gerald advocated for an incursion of Ireland, as evidenced by his address to King Henry II. As mentioned before Rhonda Knight reads the tale of the werewolves, as well as the other mirabilia that include hybrid



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

creatures as a colonialist fantasy. She emphasizes how brutality and bestiality is used to create an image of the Irish as 'the other'.¹⁹

While one can concede that the story that Gerald tells is certainly a Marcher retelling, it can be argued that Knight bypasses the Irishness of the tale of werewolves in Ossory. The werewolves are not Gerald's invention, rather there is a long tradition of the presence of wolf-men in Ossory that far predates the Norman invasions and perhaps even has connections to the pre-Christian Irish oral tradition. John Carey identifies a family of four texts on the werewolves of Ossory of which Gerald's story is one.

The first is the Norse Konungs Skuggsjá (King's mirror). This twelfth-century text tells a tale very similar to that Gerald's. Though, in this account it was Saint Patrick, instead of the more obscure Natalis, who cursed a certain people for howling at him. The text says that all the people of this family, not just two, are wolves at certain times. Just as in Gerald's account they maintain their human intelligence in wolf form. Some are a wolf for one winter every seven years, some for each winter in seven consecutive years and then not again. This time period seems analogous to the seven years in Gerald's tale, but the Norse version does not mention Ossory.

A second account of werewolves in Ireland is the *de mirabilia Hibernia* by the 11th century Bishop Patrick of Dublin. In this poem it is told that there is a certain group of people in Ireland that can change into wolves at will, but that they must leave their bodies to do so and that the bodies cannot be moved when they are in wolf-form or they cannot return. Wounds sustained in the wolf form carry over to their human form. In this text their shapeshifting is not a punishment but a special power of an Irish family.

The missing link that Connects these two texts with Gerald's is the *De Ingantaib Érenn*, a middle Irish translation from an old Irish original from the late thirteenth century. It exists in two remaining volumes that both contain different parts of the text: One in Ballymote and one in Dublin. The book of Ballymote coincides with Patrick's account that the werewolves leave their bodies and the book of Dublin states that they come

¹⁹ KNIGHT, Rhonda. "Werewolves, monsters, and miracles: representing colonial fantasies in gerald of wales's *Topographia hibernica*". *In: Studies in Iconography*, v. 22, 2001, p. 55-86. In note 52 Knight does acknowledge the existence of the Irish folktales but does not discuss how they differ from Gerald's account nor does she discuss if the existence of a pre-existing version of the story might influence her argument of viewing the text as a colonialist fantasy.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

from Ossory and that the cursed people are the descendants of Laignech Faelad. This is important because the name Laignech Faelad appears in the *Cóir Anmann or: the aptness of names*, where the etymology of the name is explained through tales of a werewolf-warrior king. The name Faelad contains the Irish word for wolf (fael). His family, strong and possessing the special gift to turn into wolves, were all related to the kings of Ossory. This book contains tales that possibly go back to ancient Irish oral tradition. Therefore, the connection between werewolves and Ossory is one that was established for centuries and then later turned into a curse under Christianity.²⁰

VI. Writing on werewolves in the twelfth century

Gerald was part of the scholarly community of North-West Europe. His writing shares its characteristics of naturalism and an increased intellectualism.²¹ The fact that the tale of the Werewolves of Ossory and his subsequent theological discussion on transformation is the longest entry in the entire *Topographia Hibernica* fits another trend present in those circles: twelfth-century literature saw a remarkable surge in interest in folktales concerning lycanthropy. This phenomenon is called the 'werewolf renaissance of the twelfth century' by Caroline Walker Bynum.²²

Learned theological debate on werewolves and on transformation in general existed before the twelfth century. The twelfth century, however, produced not only theoretical texts on werewolves but also collections of folktales. Besides Gerald of Wales, Gervaise of Tibury, a canon lawyer and writer (1150-1220) and William of

2

²⁰ CAREY, John. "Werewolves in medieval Ireland". *In: Cambrian Medieval Celtic Studies*, v. 44, 2002, p. 37-72.

²¹ See note 15 on Gerald's naturalism. Gerald was educated at the school of Paris. Vandenbroucke states that their status was due to the presence of a series of famous masters and lists as examples: Peter Abelard, William of Conches, Gilbert de la Porée, William of Chapeauc, Peter Lombardl Alan of Lille and Peter the Cantor. See LECLERCQ, Jean; VANDERBROUCKE, François; BOUYER, Louis. *The spirituality of the Middle Ages.* London: Burnes and Oates, 1968, p. 226-227. R. N. Swanson describes new developments in philosophy in the schools. An influx of new texts and new translation from the Arab world, including a gradual rediscovering of the works of Aristotle. Some of Aristotle's work was already familiar to scholars at the beginning of the twelfth century, albeit through a patristic and Neoplatonist lens, most notably in the work of Augustine. The new Aristotelian syllogistic logic was applied to theological problems like eucharistic theory. SWANSON, R.N. *The Twelfth-century Renaissance*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1999, p. 103-106.

²² BYNUM, Caroline Walker. *Metamorphosis and Identity*. New York: Zone Books, 2001, p. 94.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

Auvergne, a French theologian (1180/90-1249) also recounted folkloric tales about werewolves, often from their local surroundings.²³

In addition, the werewolf appeared as a popular protagonist in romance stories. After the French female poet Marie de France (1160-1215) wrote *Bisclaveret*, it was soon followed by tales like *Lai de Melion* (between 1190 and 1204), *Guillaume de Palerne* (c. 1200) and Arthur and Gorlagon (late 14th century). Kirby F. Smith compares the werewolves from the French romances and defines them as all being so called "sympathetic werewolves". These are werewolves that retained their human nature and rationality despite their bestial form. For example, in the *Lai de Melion* the knight Melion is trapped in his wolf form by his unfaithful wife. When found by King Arthur he behaves tame and courtly.²⁴ This is an attribute that is shared with the werewolves of Ossory in Gerald's tale. An important difference is that these wolves generally do not possess speech so they cannot reveal their identity.²⁵

In the twelfth century the werewolf posed a theological problem: did transformation truly take place? This was in contrast to the Christian idea that animals were absolutely distinct from humans and that things were defined by their natures with a strong commitment to species immutability.²⁶ Bynum describes that several theologians adopted the views of Augustine on metamorphosis.²⁷ Augustine writes that the change of man into animal was only possible if it was willed by the omnipotence of god. He writes that demons "Can achieve nothing by means of any power belonging to their nature [...] except what God permits".²⁸

According to Augustine demons cannot create real natures, if they do achieve a perceived change it is only by means of illusion. Augustine's theory proposes that humans possess a phantom that in dreams and thought can assume various forms and

²³ FRIEDMAN, John B. "Werewolf transformation in the Manuscript Era". *In: Journal of the Early Book Society*, v. 17, 2015, p. 36-95.

²⁴ SMITH, Kirby F. "An historical study of the werewolf in literature". *In: PMLA*, v. 9, n. 1, 1894, p. 6.
²⁵ SHYOVITZ, David I. "Christians and Jews in the Twelfth-Century Werewolf Renaissance". *In: Journal of the History of Ideas*, v. 75, n. 4, 2014, p. 535-36.

²⁶ BYNUM, Caroline Walker. "Metamorphosis, or Gerald and the Werewolf". *In: Speculum*, v. 73, n. 4, 1998, p. 1011.

²⁷ She demonstrates Augustine was followed by William of Auvergne *De Universo*, William of Malmesbury, *De gestis regum Anglorum*, a pseudo-Augustinian text called *De spiritu et anima* (twelfth century) and Vincent of Beauvais in *Speculum Naturale*. BYNUM, 2001, p. 95-97.

²⁸ AUGUSTINE OF HIPPO. *The city of God against the Pagans* (editor and translation by R.W. Dyson). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998, book XVII, chapter 18, p. 843.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

is not itself a body. He believes that this phantom can present itself to other people when the actual body lies elsewhere in a "stupor far deeper and heavier than that of normal sleep"²⁹. It is this phantasmal form that can take the shape of an animal.

It may seem like the phantom interacts with the world, but this is the work of invisible demons who interact with the world on the beast's behalf.³⁰ It is noteworthy that this type of transformation, called metempsychosis, is the same type of transformation that we find in two Irish versions of the tale of the werewolves of Ossory. This type of transformation appears in the version of Bishop Patrick in the *Memorabilia Hibernica* and in the *Ingantaib Érenn* as described above.

VII. Gerald on the theory of lycanthropy

Gerald was, as previously discussed, part of the scholarly community of north west Europe. This becomes apparent when he adds a lengthy theological and theoretical reflection on metamorphosis when revising his text to be addressed to an ecclesiastical audience.³¹ As was customary in these circles, he reflects on the tale of the werewolves of Ossory and includes an elaborate theoretical and theological discussion concerning the status of transformation in the tale. He means to answer two questions in this reflection: the first is a question concerning the humanity of the werewolves and the possibility of salvation, the second is a question concerning the reality of the transformation.

In this reflection it becomes clear that he is very familiar with the works of Augustine and he closely follows the argument that he makes in *De Civitate Dei*. Gerald invents a fictional synod to which he purportedly had been invited as a framework to discuss the matter of the werewolves of Ossory. When discussing the metamorphosis, he closely follows the text of Augustine in chapter 18 of book XVII and reproduces his examples from classical antiquity in a direct citation.

²⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 844.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 842-845.

³¹ The third edition of the text of the *Topographia Hibernica* contained a letter of introduction to the bishop of Hereford William de Vere, see SARGENT, Amelia Borego. "Gerald of Wales's Topographia Hibernica: Dates, Versions, Readers". *In: Viator*, v. 43, n. 1, 2012, p. 252. In this letter he recommends the bishop some passages from the *Topographia Hibernica* he thinks might interest him. It can be found fully transcribed in the series by Dimock, GIRALDUS CAMBRIENSIS. *Topographia Hibernica*. *In: Geraldus Cambriensis Opera* (edited by James, F. Dimock). London, 1867, v. 5, p. 203-204.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

This includes the tale of the Arcadian werewolves that can be found in Archadibus. These werewolves were, like the werewolves of Ossory, scapegoat werewolves, chosen by lot. They swim across a lake and change into wolves. If they do not consume human flesh they can change back into humans after nine years. However, Gerald does not reflect on these antique examples, instead he moves on to describe several folktales of transformation into hares, pigs, or beasts of burden. He does this to demonstrate that transformations are not a thing of the past, but still occurred in his time "in our times we see those as well [...]". 32

Gerald seems less sceptical about the reality of these transformations than Augustine. He agrees with Augustine that clever men or demons cannot affect real transformation and only deceive the eyes. He argues in favour of the reality of the transformation of the werewolves but only because it is issued through God: only God has the power to alter the nature of men. Saint Natalis acted upon the will of God when he cursed the people of Ossory and thus a real metamorphosis takes place.

The next question that he must answer concerns the human nature of the werewolves. Gerald asks the reader "But should such an animal be called a beast or a man? [...] Likewise, if someone kills that animal, can it be called a homicide?".³³ He brings up a different chapter of Augustine's *De Civitate Dei* that speaks about the monstrous races that might live in the east.

Augustine however, in book XVI of *De Civitate Dei*, where he raises a question about the monstrous races of men that the Orient begets; [...] whether in fact these peoples should be said to descend from the first parent/father, he adds finally.³⁴

He states that since the werewolves, like the monstrous races, are descendants of Adam that we must think of them as men despite their animal appearance. We should note that their human nature and descent from Adam would mean that they are eligible for salvation.

-

³² "Nostris quoque temporibus quosdam vidimus[...]". – GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 106.

^{33 &}quot;Sed animal hujusmodi brutum an homo dicetur? [...] Item qui hoc animal occiderit, nunquid homodica dicetur?". – GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 105.

³⁴ "Augustinus tamen, xvi libro *De Civitate* Dei, ubi de monstruosis hominum generibus quos oriens parit quaestionem movet; [...] utrum a primo parente propagati revera homines dicendi sint, tandem subjungit". – *GCO*, *Topographia Hibernica*, v. 5, p. 105. The passage in Augustine he refers to is AUGUSTINE OF HIPPO, *The city of God*, book XVI, chapter 8, p. 707-710.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

He finishes his discussion of transformation by making a remark about a different kind of transformation: that of the Eucharist. Because God can transform natures, transubstantiation can take place during the Eucharist. He adds that this transformation escapes human understanding. The fascination for metamorphosis seems intimately connected to the dogma of the transubstantiation which was being established in the thirteenth century.³⁵

We can conclude that the question about the dual nature of the werewolves was important to Gerald. He lingers on their humanity and their right to salvation. The next section will further explore the dual position of the werewolves and investigate the importance of Eucharistic theory in the case of the werewolves of Ossory.



Detail: GIRALDUS CAMBRIENSIS, *Topographia Hibernica, Lupus et Vulpis* (third quarter thirteenth century), 305 x 229 mm, tempera on parchment, Cambridge, Cambridge University Library MS Ff.1.27, p. 284.

VIII. The depiction of dual nature in the tale of the werewolves of Ossory

In the illustrations of the *Topographia Hibernica* we encounter many creatures that transgress the boundary between animal and human. Our werewolves are one of these, but we also encounter a wild woman with manes and a beard and a man-ox (**image 10**). In her book *The boundaries of the human* Dorothy Yamamoto explores the implications of exactly this type of transgression. She first examines the bestiary and

³⁵ "De illa vero speciali panis in corpus Christi mutatione, nec speciali tamen, immo verius substantiali, quia specie tota manente substantia sola mutator, hic praetereundum tutius existimavi. Quoniam supra humanam longe intelligentiam alta nimis et ardua et ejus complexion". – GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 107.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

derives from it the ground rules concerning transgression. The bestiary is, according to her, a work that through its classifying ambition is dedicated to establishing the boundaries between different categories. However, where there are boundaries, there is also the danger of lines being crossed. The bestiary shows anxiety over creatures that do not live in one area like frogs that are amphibious and ascribes to them negative attributes.

Likewise, spots and mixed colours often connote a negative association. Even more precarious than the division between different categories of animals is that between human and animal. The borderline could be crossed when for example a pregnant woman looks at the image of a monkey while pregnant, the animal will permeate into the human through the eyes and the child will be born as an anomaly.³⁶

It is interesting to compare her analysis of the Wildman with the werewolves of Ossory because they both seem to inhabit the same socio-cultural space. Yamamoto writes that the Wildman can be found just at the immediate confines of the community. In the forest he inhabits the liminal land between the known and the unknown.³⁷ A similar relationship between the civilised world and wilderness seems the case for the werewolves of Ossory. They inhabit a forest near the town of Meath. Nor are the werewolves convined to this excluded space forever.

After their punishment is fulfilled, they reintegrate into society, they move between the city and the wilderness and cross its boundary. This is not a far removed or marvellous place, in fact Gerald states that he himself was visiting Meath when he first heard the story: "Almost two years after it happened, I was told to make my crossing to Meath".³⁸

³⁶ YAMAMOTO, Dorothy. *Boundaries of the human in Medieval English Literature*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000, p. 27-33.

³⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 147.

³⁸ "Biennie fere post elapse, contigit me per Mediam transitum fecisse". – GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 104.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818



Detail: GERALD OF WALES, *Topographia Hibernica*, *The lady with the beard and crested mane and the man-ox* (c.1196-1223), Ink drawings on parchment, 275 x 190 mm, London, British Library Royal MS. 13. B viii f.19r.

In the images seen in the 'London' and the 'Cambridge' manuscript (**images 1** and **4**.) this space is invoked by two trees between which the priest has made his fire. The priest is completely enclosed by the trees, seeming to suggest that he is surrounded by the forest. Yamamoto contrasts this liminality that exists close to society with that of the monstrous races at the edge of the earth. In the case of the werewolves of Ossory however, they exist both as wild creatures on the fringe of society and as marvellous creatures at the edge of the earth.

While Ireland was increasingly familiar to Gerald, it was still considered to be the western most edge of the known world. John Block Friedman sates that Ireland, as a place in the furthest extremities of the map is more likely to be inhabited by extreme peoples. He illustrates this by citing Benedictine monk Ranulf Higden's (1280-1363) *Polychronicon* on Ireland stating: "note that at the farthest reaches of the world often occur new marvels and wonders," thus it seems that the werewolves of Ossory are simultaneously marvellous creatures that exist at the edge of the earth and liminal creatures that exist close to society.

³⁹ FRIEDMAN, John Block. The monstrous races at the edge of the earth. New York, 2000, p. 43.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

The werewolves of Ossory transgress the boundary between human and animal, but they do so in a decidedly different way than the Wildman or the monstrous races. In the case of the Wildman not only his appearance makes his humanity dubitable, but often his behaviour makes him hard to discern from an animal as well. Very often the Wildman displays unbridled lust or aggression. In many cases he cannot speak and only emits animalistic noises. ⁴⁰ Gerald does not describe the behaviour of the bearded lady, he just states that "This woman, of double wondrous monstrosity, was however not a hermaphrodite, but [possessed] otherwise the softened nature of a woman". ⁴¹

This sentence suggests that her human nature was not in question. Despite being depicted naked, which could signify a wild nature she is also depicted holding a spindle which shows that she is human enough to engage in crafts. The image calls to mind parallels with the depiction of Eve after the expulsion from paradise. The hybrid nature and hybrid appearance are more clearly present in the man-ox. "He had no words. He uttered only lowing by way of speech." In the case of the werewolves of Ossory the appearance of the creature is less ambiguous and more decidedly animal.

This is contrasted with a firm emphasis on the wolves' humanity. The wolf never growls or shows animalistic tendencies, instead he is polite and devoutly Christian. In fact, the sentences spoken by the wolf seem to deliberately use extra complex constructions in comparison to sentences spoken by the priest to display eloquence. An example would be: "And my female companion of this pilgrimage has fallen gravely ill not far from this place. Already passing to her end, may you grant, that she looks upon the priestly solace of divine mercy". The construction, using multiple subclauses in the second sentence, is a very formal and complex way to speak. The very first words that the werewolf speaks are: "Be assured, and do not fear" This is a biblical turn of phrase that is used by angels when they reveal themselves to humans, as not to frighten them with their appearance. The words used to describe

⁴⁰ YAMAMOTO, Dorothy, op. cit., p. 154-158.

⁴¹ "Mulier ista, duplici prodigio monstruosa, non hermaphrodita tamen, sed alias muliebri natura tantum emollita". – *GCO*, *Topographia Hibernica*, v. 5, p. 107.

⁴² "Verba ei nulla. Mugitum enim tantum per sermone reddebat". – *GCO*, *Topographia Hibernica*, v. 5, p. 108.

⁴³ "Et mihi quidem peregrinationis hujus socia non procul hinc graviter infirmatur. Cui, si placet, jam in extremis agenti, sacerdotale solatium intuit divinae pietatis indulgeas". – GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 102.

⁴⁴ "Securi estote, et nolite timere". – GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 101.

⁴⁵ See for example Matthew 28:5.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

the answers given by the wolf also underline his Christian piety. The wolf reassures the priest with "good (sanum) words about god" and he offers "Orthodox (Catholicum)" answers to all questions asked. The transgression of the boundary here seems not to be a hybrid human displaying animalistic behaviour but rather a discordance between form and nature.

We see a profound change by the time we next encounter werewolves in a painted miniature. Friedman discusses the depictions of lycanthropy in *The secrets of Natural History.*⁴⁷ It was discussed previously that the werewolves in the *Topographia Hibernica* are not distinguishable from regular wolves. Even though the story features a transformation this transformation is not depicted. When we turn to the fifteenth century manuscript of *The Secrets* there are two differences in the way werewolves are depicted. The first is that we now have a clear depiction of transformation, the second is a focus on the cruel and bestial nature of the werewolves who even when they are in the shape of men, attack humans.⁴⁸ These early modern manuscripts treat werewolves in a way that is closer to the Wildman: they depict hybrid forms and hybrid natures. There seems to be a medieval reluctance to depict the werewolf transformation, this can perhaps be acquitted to the previously explored anxieties concerning the transgressing of boundaries.

In this section it has been demonstrated that the werewolves in Gerald's story cannot be classified as hybrid creatures, nor do they display a hybrid nature. Rather we witness a discord between the form of the creature, which is distinctly animal and the creature's nature which is distinctly human. These debates on the possibility of transformation and whether the form or the nature of a thing can be changed were

-

⁴⁶ GCO, Topographia Hibernica, v. 5, p. 101.

⁴⁷ This is an anonymous French translation of the fourteenth book of the *Redecturum Morale* a text by Benedictine encyclopaedist Pierre Bersuire (c. 1290-1362). Bersuire draws, amongst other sources, upon Gervaise of Tilbury, a contemporary of Gerald who wrote on folktales from the Auvergne including tales of werewolf transformation. Three fifteenth century manuscripts of *The secrets of Natural History* depict werewolf transformation. – FRIEDMAN, John B. "Werewolf transformation in the Manuscript Era". *In: Journal of the Early Book Society*, v. 17, 2015, p. 38.

⁴⁸ Bibliothèque nationale de France MS fr. 1377-1379, fol. 2v from 1427 shows the werewolf as a hybrid creature. The metamorphoses is not depicted but the creature is distinctly man like, semi erect but covered with hair and has the head of a wolf. On f.70r the master of Maguerite d'Orleans the aforementioned tale of the men that cross a river and turn into wolves is illustrated. This is the first time we see a transformation depicted. On one end of the river we see men in animal poses biting a victim. On the other bank we see an ordinary wolf and a wolf with a human head. Friedman argues that this shows the temporal process of transformation back to human status. – *Ibid.*, p. 58.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

also prevalent in twelfth-century Eucharistic theory. Gerald himself briefly mentions the Eucharist as a metamorphosis that is willed by God and escapes human understanding. The next section will explore twelfth-century Eucharistic theory and its role in forming the medieval community.

IX. Eucharistic theory and the shaping of medieval communities

Theories surrounding the Eucharist where developing during Gerald's lifetime. Part of the new scholastic debates were concerned with Eucharistic theory. Bernard Hamilton explains in his book *The Christian World of the middle ages* that in traditional teaching Christ was believed to be truly present in the Eucharist, and that in the twelfth century this presence was being redefined in scholastic terminology. These debates utilise Aristotelian theory analysing the relationship between the appearance and the real character of an object.

There were attempts to give logical explanations on how the consecrated host could have the appearance of bread but have its true character be the body of Christ.⁴⁹ Finally, in 1215 the fourth Lateran council's opening statement defines the transubstantiation as the body of Christ being truly contained under the form of bread and wine and that they are transubstantiated into the body and blood.⁵⁰ Gerald has shown himself to believe firmly in the veracity of the transformation as previously shown. He uses it as an example of a transformation affected by the omnipotence of God.

4

⁴⁹ HAMILTON, Bernard. *The Christian World of the Middle Ages.* Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 2003, p. 56-57.

There is one universal Church of the faithful, outside of which there is absolutely no salvation. In which there is the same priest and sacrifice, Jesus Christ, whose body and blood are truly contained in the sacrament of the altar under the forms (sub speciebus) of bread and wine: the bread being changed by divine power into the body, and the wine into the blood (trabssubstantianis pane in corpus et vino in sanguinem potestate divina) so that to realise the mystery of unity we may receive of him what he has received of us." Heinrich Denzinger, and Adolf Schönmetzer, *Enchiridion symbolorum definitionum et declarationum de rebus fidei et morum*, (Freiburg, Basel, Rome & Vienna: Herder, 1997), p.802; Elizabeth Saxon further expands on the exact debates that took place in 12th century France. Saxon opposes a linear narrative and shows that there is a wide diversity of thought both before and after the council. She argues that the opening gives statement not so much a definition of what exactly transubstantiation is but merely asserts Christ's presence, and not the mode of that presence. – SAXON, Elizabeth. *The Eucharist in Romanesque France: iconography and theology.* Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2006, p. 29-34.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

In his book Sacrifice and Community: Jewish offering and Christian Eucharist Matthew Levering argues that the Eucharist makes the church. It defines the Christian community because through its sacramental nature it facilitates for the believers an embodied sharing in Christ's sacrifice. According to him the doctrine of transubstantiation is essential to this creation of the Christian community. He writes that "By insisting upon the sacramental bodylines of Christ's sacrificial presence in the Eucharist, the doctrine of transubstantiation upholds the absolute unity of the sacrifice." ⁵¹

Having reviewed the twelfth-century debates concerning transubstantiation and Gerald's position therein and seen how this doctrine constitutes medieval communities, we can return to the role of the Eucharist in the image cycle. The Eucharist plays a central part in the section of the image cycle where the she-wolf receives the viaticum (images 2 and 6). The Eucharist is literally situated at the centre of the image in both manuscripts and is the focal point of the image. We see the Eucharist, an object that underwent a transubstantiation in which the nature was changed, but the form remained the same. In a parallel we see the dying she-wolf. She is a creature that underwent a transformation where her form has changed but the nature remained the same.

The two touch one another and mirror one another as real transformations that are affected through God's omnipotence and that escape human understanding. In the image the she-wolf is separated from the priest by a boundary formed by her den which encloses her. The host is of vital importance because it transgresses this boundary and forms the bridge between the priest and the she-wolf and thus enables the two figures to converge. Since taking communion makes one part of the medieval community this image showcases the crucial moment where the werewolf is being included in the Christian community.

Conclusion

_

In conclusion we can say that the werewolves of Ossory aren't animalistic and hybrid monsters but rather dual creatures with a strong emphasis on their humanity that traverse boundaries between human and animal and the community and the

⁵¹ LEVERING, Matthew. Sacrifice and Community: Jewish offering and Christian Eucharist. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2005, p. 117.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

wilderness. At the apex of their story the administering of the eucharist shows that the verdict was not to 'other' them but rather to include them into the community.

Sources

- AUGUSTINE OF HIPPO. The city of God against the Pagans (editor and translation by R.W. Dyson). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998.
- DENZINGER, Heinrich; SCHÖNMETZER, Adolf . Enchiridion symbolorum definitionum et declarationum de rebus fidei et morum. Freiburg, Basel, Rome & Vienna: Herder, 1997.
- GIRALDUS CAMBRIENSIS. *Topographia Hibernica*. *In: Geraldus Cambriensis Opera* (edited by James, F. Dimock). London, 1867, v. 5.

Bibliography

BARTLETT, Robert. Gerald of Wales 1146-122. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982.

BARTLETT, Robert. Gerald of Wales: a voice of the Middle Ages. Stroud: The History Press, 2006.

BYNUM, Caroline Walker. "Metamorphosis, or Gerald and the Werewolf". *In: Speculum*, v. 73, n. 4, 1998, p. 987-1013.

BYNUM, Caroline Walker. Metamorphosis and Identity. New York: Zone Books, 2001.

CAREY, John. "Werewolves in medieval Ireland". *In: Cambrian Medieval Celtic Studies*, v. 44, 2002, p. 37-72.

FRIEDMAN, John B. *The Monstrous Races in Medieval Art and Thought*. Cambridge: Syracuse University Press, 1981.

FRIEDMAN, John B. "Werewolf transformation in the Manuscript Era". *In: Journal of the Early Book Society*, v. 17, 2015, p. 36-95.

FRIEDMAN, John B. The monstrous races at the edge of the earth. New York, 2000.

HAMILTON, Bernard. The Christian World of the Middle Ages. Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 2003.

HOLMES, Urban T. "Gerald the Naturalist". In: Speculum, v. 11, n. 1, 1936, p. 111-120.

KNIGHT, Rhonda. "Werewolves, monsters, and miracles: representing colonial fantasies in gerald of wales's *Topographia hibernica*". *In: Studies in Iconography*, v. 22, 2001, p. 55-86.

LECLERCQ, Jean; VANDERBROUCKE, François; BOUYER, Louis. *The spirituality of the Middle Ages.* London: Burnes and Oates, 1968.

LEVERING, Matthew. Sacrifice and Community: Jewish offering and Christian Eucharist. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2005.

MCKENDRICK, Scot; LOWDEN, John; DOYLE, Kathleen. Royal Manuscripts: the Genius of Illumination. London: British Library, 2011.

MELLINKOFF, Ruth. Outcasts: Signs of Otherness in Northern European Art of the Late Middle Ages. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993.

ROONEY, Catherine. The manuscripts of the works of Gerald of Wales. PhD dissertation, University of Cambridge, 2005.



Jun-Dic 2020/ISSN 1676-5818

- SARGENT, Amelia Borego. Visions and Revisions: Gerald of Wales, Authorship, and the Construction of Political, Religious, and Legal Geographies in Twelfth and Thirteenth Century Britain. PhD dissertation, University of Berkeley, 2011.
- SARGENT, Amelia Borego. "Gerald of Wales's Topographia Hibernica: Dates, Versions, Readers". *In: Viator*, v. 43, n. 1, 2012, p. 241-261.
- SAXON, Elizabeth. The Eucharist in Romanesque France: iconography and theology. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2006.
- SCHMITT, Jean-Claude. La raison des gestes dans l'Occident medievale. Paris: Gallimard, 1990.
- SMITH, Kirby F. "An historical study of the werewolf in literature". *In: PMLA*, v. 9, n. 1, 1894, p. 1-42. SHYOVITZ, David I. "Christians and Jews in the Twelfth-Century Werewolf Renaissance". *In: Journal of the History of Ideas*, v. 75, n. 4, 2014, p. 521-543.
- SWANSON, R.N. The Twelfth-century Renaissance. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1999.
- YAMAMOTO, Dorothy. Boundaries of the human in Medieval English Literature. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.